#### Selecting and Monitoring Investment Manager(s)

#### USA RISK GROUP CONFERENCE 2012

Carl E Terzer Principal CapVisor Associates.LLC

Reproduction or redistribution of materials herein is strictly forbidden. © Copyright 2012 CapVisor Associates, LLC. All rights reserved.



#### **Session Objectives**



Capvisor Associates

- •Learn how to properly and efficiently select a "Best Fit" Insurance Asset Manager for your captive.
- •Determine the elements of investment plan design that need to be completed prior to the manager search process.
- •How to construct an appropriate "consideration set" of managers.
- •Measuring results.

Are you ready to pick an investment manager?

 Do you have assets that need to support liabilities/claims payments?

**Investment Plan Design Elements** 

- 2. Do you have an Investment Policy Statement (IPS)?
- 3. Do you have a Strategic Asset Allocation?
- 4. Do you have Investment Guidelines?
- 5. Have you designed Performance Benchmarks?
- Do you have an Actuarial Report and Tax/Accounting Guidance?





# Investment Manager Selection



# Pitfalls to avoid at the start



When a Captive is deciding on which investment managers to evaluate, these are usually worth skipping:

- their brother-in-law, the broker
- the guy who handles the board members' personal account
- the insurer's pension/401k investment manager
- the most conveniently located manager
- the "one stop shop for all your financial needs" manager
- the firm that provides the fanciest reports and seems to have "decent" performance
- And do not necessarily include the firm(s) mentioned when the question "who do you know who does this business" is asked



# **Insurance Asset Management**

... requires a unique skill set and investment process



#### Institutional Investment Managers

- Investment process is designed for a "Total Return" objective
- There are usually no tax considerations when trading securities
- Risk budget is allocated uniformly across the portfolio
- Long-term bond portfolios are seldom constructed around liabilities (LDI)
- Regulatory and accounting considerations are minimal on a comparative basis

#### Insurance Asset Managers

- Investment process is primarily designed for an "Income Maximization" objective
- Most contemplated transactions are evaluated on an after tax basis
- Risk budget is apportioned across the liquidity, reserve, and surplus portfolios
- Reserve portfolios are structured to match anticipated claims payout patterns and the overall liability duration (ALM)
- Regulatory and accounting considerations may sometimes override investment considerations in security selection



# **The Manager Selection Process**

Four Steps to a "Best Fit" Manager

- 1. Evaluate the universe of investment managers
- 2. Screen to determine the "Consideration Set"
  - Qualitative and Quantitative analysis
- 3. Scrutinize finalists
- 4. Check references and industry reputation





# Qualitative and quantitative decision criteria

What's important to Captives ?

#### Service

- Receiving an appropriate level of high quality service for their account
- Ensuring that their account is a "good fit" in the manager's current book of business
- Ensuring that reporting meets the requirement of the captive and their captive management firm

#### Performance

- Protecting principal while earning a competitive risk-adjusted return
- Enjoying the ride!

#### Fees

- Paying an institutional fee rate
- Paying a competitive fee based upon the unique servicing requirements of their account



# Manager selection criterion

....the professional method

- Philosophy
  - "Total Return" or "Yield Maximization"
  - Active, passive or blended management
- Process
  - Top down or bottom up
  - Alpha attribution: duration, yield curve, sector, security selection
  - Style analysis
  - Tax efficiency

#### • Performance

- MPT Statistical assessment (Riskadjusted return analysis)
- After-tax performance
- Adherence to guidelines
- Universe comparison



- Personnel
  - Insurance asset management experience
  - Insurance regulatory, tax and accounting expertise
  - Insurance Accounting and reporting capabilities

#### Client-specific criteria

- Execution of policy objective & adherence to guidelines and regulations
- Fees/Value for service
- Portfolio tax liability management
- Client service and other administrative responsibilities
- Accounting & Reporting efficacy
- Overall relationship efficiency



# Evaluate the universe of investment managers

- Data Sources: eVestment Alliance, PSN, Wilshire, Morningstar, etc.
- Recommendations from advisors



- Separate the Insurance Asset Managers from the Investment Managers eliminating:
  - Institution managers primarily focused on pension, 401k, endowment and foundation or public funds markets
  - Wealth management or retail focused firms

#### The definitive differentiators

- Systems that optimize asset allocations subject to the insurer's liability structure
- Demonstrated expertise in Asset Liability Management (ALM)





# Selecting the "Consideration Set"



How should you determine which Insurance Asset Managers to consider ?

#### **Qualitative Criterion**

- Insurance market focus
- Market segment
- Company size...target client size
- AUM Composition/Asset type

#### **Quantitative Criterion**

Performance (total return composite or risk-adjusted after-tax)
Fees



# **Evaluating the "Consideration Set"**

How to pick from the finalists

- Marketing materials and/or demonstrated interest
- Request for Proposal (RFP)
- Presentations
  - In-person
  - Webex/phone etc.



Do you know the right questions to ask? Can you differentiate between managers and their styles? Can you properly assess performance?



# Investment Manager Assessment



#### Sample Bond Managers Performance



Period	1 YR.	3 YR.	5 YR.	Duration
<b>BENCHMARK*</b>	5.8	5.65	5.87	3.97
MANAGERS				
А	5.84	6.96	5.88	4.03
В	6.47	6.26	5.98	N/A
С	5.24	9.74	7.45	3.86
D	5.39	5.97	6.32	3.91
E	5.47	5.72	6.26	3.88
F	5.54	6.27	6.32	3.34
G	6.53	6.86	6.97	4.2
Н	5.43	5.64	4.39	N/A
I	4.2	5.38	4.98	3.19

\*BARCLAY'S CAPITAL INTERMEDIATE GOV/CREDIT Data Through 12/30/11



14

# Quantitative manager selection criterion ....the professional method



**Performance vs. benchmark** (rolling YTD, one, three, five year periods)

#### Modern Portfolio Theory (MPT) statistical evaluation

- Alpha measures managers risk adjusted performance
- **Beta** measures manager's systemic risk
- **R-squared** comparison measurement of managers returns to market index
- Standard deviation measures manager's return dispersion or variance
- Tracking error measures how closely manager tracks index returns
- Sharpe ratio -measures manager's excess return over risk free rate of return
- Sortino ratio Sharpe ratio refinement which differentiates harmful volatility from volatility in general by replacing standard deviation with downside deviation in the denominator
- Up-market capture ratio -measures manager's performance in up markets relative to index
- Down-market capture ratio -opposite of up-market capture ratio
- **Batting average** -measures manager's ability to meet or beat market consistently
- And many additional statistics measuring risk adjusted performance



# Measuring a Manager's Performance

....the professional method

#### Return analysis

- Performance vs. Benchmark
- Risk-adjusted performance
- Tax efficiency
- Net of fees
- Universe comparison

#### Compliance analysis

- Domicile regulations
- Investment policy
- Investment guidelines

#### **Overall Program Efficacy**

- Meets or does not meet expectations (returns, risk, communications, etc)
- Overall comfort level
- Plan revisions?





## Case Study: Uninformed Insurance Company, a RRG











## Case Study: Uninformed Insurance Company, a RRG

**Bond Portfolio Detail** 







Source: SNL data 12/30/11

#### Summary: Opportunity Cost

Why a finely tuned investment program is important to your captive

Case Study: UIC, RRG – \$9,110,000 Portfolio, SC Domiciled Med Mal Writer

Inefficient asset allocation Cost: \$60,764 (2011)



- Reducing cash position to 5% and investing in bonds @5.8% = \$60,764 lost return for last year
- Underperforming P&C "Average Return" cost = \$99,299 (2011) & \$134,828 (2010).
- Superior advisor/manager" benefit= \$235,949 (2011) \$225,928 (2010)
  - Assumes manager beats industry average of 3.66 and 3.93, respectively by 150BPs



# Keys for Success in Your Captive's Investment Program



CapVisor believes that the key to an optimized and successful insurance investment program is based upon the:

- Correlation of your investment strategy with your business objectives and risk tolerance
- Utilization of a component approach to align assets with underwriting/liability structure along three primary components:
  - Short-term liquidity
  - Loss reserve
  - Surplus
- Anticipation of changes in your circumstances and securities market trends in order to maximize return and protect portfolio liquidity
- Enforce a disciplined management style on selected manager and measure their ability to precisely executing strategies within investment guidelines and within regulatory, tax and accounting environment
- Frequent and effective communication of status, progress and results



#### **Session Conclusions**



•Learn how to properly and efficiently select a "Best Fit" Insurance Asset Manager for your captive.

•Right-Sized manager, target clients, investment sophistication, insurance expertise, philosophy/style, risk adjusted, competitive returns and fees, etc.

•Determine the elements of investment plan design that need to be completed prior to the manager search process.

•Lack of a plan most often leads to selection of the wrong manager , not to mention a poor investment result

•How to construct an appropriate "consideration set" of managers.

•Select from "Best Fit" consideration set an "Insurance Asset Manager"

•Measuring results.

•Risk-adjusted, after tax returns are what's important, not absolute returns (Performance vs benchmark)

